

Affirmative Reasoning: Volume II (Part Two of Ten)

**Validation of Cognition Through Discourse  
(Gautam's Nyay Sutr)**

**Chapter IB**

**Discourse and Deliberation**

**GIB-1.** In a discourse both sides provide the facts supported by suitable evidence and arguments that do not contradict other established conclusions. Both the proponent and the opponent conclude discourse with a conclusion that is not inconsistent with established facts, and is consistent with the evidence, deduction and means.

**प्रमाणतर्कसाधनोपालम्भः सिद्धान्ताविरुद्धः पञ्चाव-  
यवोपपन्नः पक्षप्रतिपक्षपरिग्रहो वादः ॥ १ ॥**

i. 2. 1. *pramāna-tarka-sādhanā-upālabdhah siddhānta-aviruddhah  
pañca-avyava-upapannah pakṣa-pratipakṣa<sup>20</sup>-parigrahaḥ  
vādah.*

20. *pakṣa-parigrahaḥ VSS.*

*Praman tark sadhan upalambhah siddhant a-viruddhah panch avyav upannah pakch  
pratipakch parigrahaḥ vadah.*

**GIB-2.** Scrutiny and cross-examination are part of discourse to identify ambiguity and consider alternative interpretation of the evidence.

**यथोक्तो-  
पपन्नश्चलजातिनिग्रहस्थानसाधनोपालम्भो जल्पः ॥ २ ॥**

i. 2. 2. *yathokta-upapannah chala jāti-nigrahassthāna-sādhanā-  
upālabdhah jalpah.*

*Yatha uktah upannah chal jati nigrah-sthan sadhan upalambhah jalpah.*

**GIB-3.** Sceptics show weakness in the counter-argument without offering an alternative.

**स प्रतिपक्षस्थापनाहीनो वितण्डा ॥ ३ ॥**

i. 2. 3. *saḥ<sup>21</sup> pratipakṣa-sthāpanā-hinah vitandā.*  
21. *sva-pratipakṣa...V*

*Sa prati-pakch sthapna hinah vitanda.*

\*

## Debate and Cross-Examination

GIB-4. Contradictory, inconsistent, or untimely evidence gives impression of false relevance.

**सव्यभिचारविरुद्धप्रकरणसमसाध्यसमकालातीता  
हेत्वाभासाः ॥ ४ ॥**

- i. 2.4. *savyabhicāra-viruddha-prakaraṇasama-sādhyasama-kālā-*  
*tītāḥ<sup>22</sup> hetvābhāsāḥ.<sup>23</sup>*  
22. *-atītakālāḥ*. Bibl. Ind., VSS, NV, R, B, nvr, NVi, V, NM  
596, Up. iii. 1.17.  
23. *pañca hetvābhāsāḥ*. Up.

*Sa vyabhichar viruddh prakaran-sam sadhya-sam kal-atitah hetu-abhasah.*

GIB-5. Such indifferences (to the context and relations of concern and evidence) introduce contradiction.

**अनैकान्तिकः सव्यभिचारः ॥ ५ ॥**

- i. 2.5. *anaikāntikāḥ<sup>24</sup> savyabhicārah.*  
24. *anaikāntāḥ*. R, NVi.

*An-eikantikah sa vyabhicharah.*

GIB-6. Consistency with an established conclusion is desirable, and the opposite is not.

**सिद्धान्तमभ्युपेत्य तद्विरोधी विरुद्धः ॥ ६ ॥**

- i. 2.6. *siddhāntam abhyupetya tat-virodhī<sup>25</sup> viruddhaḥ.*  
25. *tad-viruddhāḥ*. NM 600.

*Siddhantam abhyupetya tat virodhi viruddhah.*

GIB-7. A superficial context for a concern distracts from further consideration.

**यस्मात्प्रकरणचिन्ता स निर्णयार्थ-  
मपदिष्टः प्रकरणसमः ॥ ७ ॥**

- i. 2.7. *yasmāt prakaraṇa-cintā saḥ nirṇayārtham apadiṣṭaḥ*  
*prakaraṇa-samaḥ.*

*Yasmat prakaran chinta sa nirnay-artham ap-dishtah prakaran samah.*

GIB-8. An indefinite concern can not be deliberated.

**साध्याविशिष्टः साध्यत्वात्साध्यसमः ॥ ८ ॥**

- i. 2.8. *sādhyā avīṣiṣṭaḥ<sup>26</sup> sādhyatvāt<sup>27</sup> sādhyasamaḥ.*  
26. *-aviṣiṣṭatāḥ ca*. B, nvr, R, NSN.  
27. *sādhyā-aviṣiṣṭatāḥ* added after *sādhyatvāt* in NVi.

*Sadhya a-vishishtah sadhyatvat a-sadhya-samah.*

GIB-9. It is like unrelated part from the past.

**कालात्ययापदिष्टः कालातीतः ॥ ९ ॥**

- i. 2.9. *kālātyayā apadiṣṭaḥ kālātītaḥ.*

*Kal-atyaya ap-dishtah kal atitah.*

\*

### Mis-interpretation

GIB-10. Ambiguous words and meaning distract and mislead.

**वचनविघातो ऽर्थविकल्पोपपत्त्या क्लम ॥ १० ॥**

i. 2.10. *vacana-vighātaḥ artha-vikalpa-upapattiyā chalam.*

*Vachan vighatah arth vikalpah uppattaya chalam.*

GIB-11. Ambiguity may be in improper choice of words, or unsupported generalizations, or unsuitable methods and means of reasoning.

**तत्रिविधं वाक्छलं सामान्यच्छलमुपचारच्छलं  
चेति ॥ ११ ॥**

i. 2.11. *tat trividham vāk-chalam sāmānya-chalam upacāra-chalam ca.*<sup>28</sup>

28. *iti*, as occurring at the end in certain versions, does not occur in NSN, NM 614, nvr, V, R.

*Tat trividham vak chalam samanya chalam upchar chalam ch iti.*

GIB-12. Ambiguous words are often intended to mislead and distract (from the content or context).

**अविशेषाभिहिते ऽर्थे वक्तुरभिप्रायादर्थान्तरकल्पना वाक्छलम् ॥ १२ ॥**

i. 2.12. *avishēṣa-abhihite arthe vaktuḥ abhiprāyād arthāntara-*

*kalpanā vāk-chalam.*

29. *aha tatra* added at the beginning of the *sūtra* in NM 614

*Avishesh abhi-hite arthe vaktuh abhiprayad arthantar kalpna vak-chalam.*

GIB-13. Generalization is a common distraction that directs the general meaning towards unlikely or imagined meanings.

**संभवतो ऽर्थस्यातिसामान्ययोगादसंभू-  
तार्थकल्पना सामान्यच्छलम् ॥ १३ ॥**

i. 2.13. *sambhavataḥ arthasya atisāmānya-yogād asambhūta-artha-*

*kalpanā sāmānya-chalam.*<sup>30</sup>

30. *sāmānyam*. ASS.

*Sambhavtah arthasya ati-samannya yogad a-sambhut-arth kalpna samanya chalam.*

GIB-14. Distracted reasoning builds on ambiguous behavior to refute consistent behavior.

**धर्मविकल्पनिर्देशे ऽर्थसद्भावप्रतिषेध उपचारच्छलम् ॥ १४ ॥**

i. 2.14. *dharma-vikalpa-nirdeśe artha-sadbhāva-pratiśedhaḥ upacāra-*

*chalam.*

*Dharm vikalp nirdeshe arth sadbhav pratishedhah upchar chalam.*

GIB-15. Distracting words and mis-leading reasoning are often indistinguishable.

**वाक्छलमेवोपचारच्छलं तदविशेषात् ॥ १५ ॥**

i. 2.15. *vāk-chalam eva upacāra-chalam tat-avishēṣāt.*

*Vak chalam ev upchar chalam tat avisheshat.*

GIB-16. This is not because both change the intended meaning.

न तदर्थान्तरभावात् ॥ १६ ॥

i. 2.16. *na<sup>31</sup> tat-arthāntara-bhāvāt.*

31. *naitat-arthā...VSS.*

*Na tat arth-antar bhavat.*

GIB-17. There is little difference between occasional behavior and misleading context.

अविशेषे वा किञ्चित्साधर्म्यादेकच्छलप्रसङ्गः ॥ १७ ॥

i. 2.17. *aviśeṣe vā kiñcit-sādharmyāt eka-chala<sup>32</sup>-prasāṅgah.*

32. *\*chalatra\* VSS. This is an improvement. A still better emendation, however, would have been *chala-ekatra-prasāṅgah.**

*Avisheshe va kinchit sadharmyat ek chal prasangah.*

GIB-18. Distraction from the class results from inability to distinguish related and unrelated behaviors.

साधर्म्यवैधर्म्याभ्यां प्रत्यवस्थानं जातिः ॥ १८ ॥

i. 2.18. *sādharmya-vaidharmyābhyāṃ pratyavasthānaṃ jātiḥ.*

*Sa-dharm vai-dharm-abhyam pratyavasthanam jatih.*

GIB-19. Innuendos evoke unrelated or lack of meaning.

विप्रतिपत्तिरप्रतिपत्तिश्च निग्रहस्थानम् ॥ १९ ॥

i. 2.19. *vīpratipattiḥ apratipattiḥ ca nigrāhasthānam.*

*Vi-pratipattiḥ a-pratipattiḥ ch nigrāh-sthanam.*

GIB-20. There are far too many classes of innuendoes that introduce ambiguities.

तद्विकल्पाज्जातिनिग्रहस्थानबहुत्वम् ॥ २० ॥

i. 2.20. *tat vikalpāi jāti-nigrāhasthāna-bahutvam.*

*Tat vikalpat jati nigrāh-sthan bahutvam.*

\*\*\*\*\*