

Affirmative Reasoning: Volume II (Part Ten of Ten)

**Validation of Cognition Through Discourse  
(Gautam's Nyay Sutr)**

**Chapter VB**

**Proposition and Assertion**

A proposition for further consideration has a clear outline of the assertions with supporting arguments. Some pitfalls are outlined.

**GVB-1.** Many factors weaken and discredit an assertion (*pratigya*). It may be wrong, repetitive, inconsistent, or already discarded. Its meaning may be indifferent, irrelevant, different, insignificant, or obscure. It may be premature, untimely, under-stated, over-stated, or re-stated. Its may inadequately elaborate key points, ignore key considerations, bring-in unrelated considerations, ignore established propositions, or create false impression.

प्रतिज्ञाहानिः प्रतिज्ञान्तरं प्रतिज्ञाविरोधः प्रतिज्ञासंन्या-  
सा हेत्वन्तरमर्थान्तरं निरर्थकमविज्ञातार्थमपार्थक्यमप्राप्त-  
कालं न्यूनमधिकं पुनरुक्तमननुभाषणमज्ञानमप्रतिभा विक्षे-  
पो मतानुज्ञा पर्यनुद्योज्योपेक्षणं निरनुद्योज्यानुयोगो ऽपसि-  
द्धान्तो हेत्वाभासाश्च निग्रहस्थानानि ॥ १ ॥

v. 2.1. *pratijñā-hāniḥ pratijñāntaram pratijñā-virodhaḥ pratijñā-  
sannyāsaḥ hetvantarom arthāntaram nirarthakam  
avijñātārtham apārthakam aprāpta-kālam nyūnam adhikam  
punaruktam ananubhāṣaṇam ajñānam apratibhā vikṣepaḥ  
matānujñā paryanuyojya-upekṣaṇam niranuyojya-anuyogaḥ  
apasiddhāntaḥ hetvābhāsaḥ ca nigrahassthānāni.*

*Pratigya-haniḥ pratigya-antar pratigya-virodh pratigya-sanyas hatu-antaram arth-  
antaram nir-arthkam avigyat-artham apar-arthakam aprapt-kalam nyunam adhicam  
punaruktam an-anubhashnam agyanam apratibha vikchepah matanugya pari-anuyojya-  
upeckchanam niranuyojya-anaugohah ap-siddhantah hatu-abhassh ch nigrahashthanani.*

**GVB-2.** Analog in support of the assertion may have different behavior or support the counter-point.

प्रतिदृष्टान्तधर्माभ्यनुज्ञा स्वदृष्टान्ते प्रतिज्ञाहानिः ॥ २ ॥

v. 2.2. *pratidṛṣṭānta-dharma-abhyanuṣṭhā svā-dṛṣṭānte pratijñāhāniḥ.*

*Pratidrashtant dharm abhy-anugya sv-drashtante pratigya hanih.*

**GVB-3.** An assertion may be altered for refutation if its indicated meaning or behavior is ambiguous.

**प्रतिज्ञातार्थप्रतिषेधे धर्मविकल्पान्तदर्थनिर्देशः  
प्रतिज्ञान्तरम् ॥ ३ ॥**

v. 2.3. *pratijñāta-artha-pratiṣedhe dharmā<sup>39</sup>vikalpāt<sup>40</sup> tad-artha<sup>41</sup>-  
nirdeśaḥ pratijñāntaram.*

39. NM : dharme.

40. VSS : -vikalpena.

41. VSS : tadartham.

*Pratigyat-arth pratishdhe dharm vikalpat tat arth nirdeshah pratigya-antaram.*

**GVB-4.** Inconsistency within an assertion is also inconsistency of its relevance.

**प्रतिज्ञाहेत्वोर्विरोधः प्रतिज्ञाविरोधः ॥ ४ ॥**

v. 2.4. *pratijñā-hetvoh virodhaḥ pratijñā-virodhaḥ.*

*Pratigya hetvoh virodhah pratigya virodhah.*

**GVB-5.** An assertion is discarded forever if it is refuted or its meaning is in doubt.

**पक्षप्रतिषेधे प्रतिज्ञातार्थापनयनं प्रतिज्ञासंन्यासः ॥ ५ ॥**

v. 2.5. *pakṣa-pratiṣedhe pratijñāta<sup>42</sup>-artha<sup>43</sup>-apanayanam<sup>44</sup>  
pratijñā-sannyāsaḥ.*

42. NM : pratijñā.

43. nvr : arthasya.

44. NM : upanayanam.

*Pakch pratishedhe pratigya arth ap-nayananam pratigya sanyasah.*

**GVB-6.** Relevance is altered if the stated purpose is refuted.

**अविशेषोक्ते हेतौ प्रतिषिद्धे विशेषमिच्छता हेत्वन्तरम् ॥ ६ ॥**

v. 2.6. *aviśeṣokte hetau pratiṣiddhe<sup>45</sup> viśeṣam icchataḥ hetvantaram.*

45. NM : pratiṣiddham.

*A-vishesh-ukte hetau pratisiddhe vishesham icchataḥ hetu-antram.*

**GVB-7.** Different meaning is indicated if the stated meaning departs from the natural meaning and relations in the construct.

**प्रकृतादर्थप्रतिसंबद्धार्थमर्थान्तरम् ॥ ७ ॥**

v. 2.7. *prakṛtād arthād apratisambaddhārtham<sup>46</sup> arthāntaram.*

46. NM : apratisambaddham; nvr : asambaddhārtham.

*Prakratat arthat a-prati-sambandh-artham arth-antarm.*

**GVB-8.** It is meaningless to elaborate the meaning of the word order in an assertion.

**वर्णक्रमनिर्देशवन्निरर्थकम् ॥ ८ ॥**

v. 2.8. *varṇa-krama-nirdeśavat nirarthakam.*

*Varn kram nirdeś-vat nirarthkam.*

**GVB-9.** A construct is considered obscure if the intended meaning can not be communicated in three attempts to a gathering of experts.

**परिषत्प्रतिवादिभ्यां त्रिरभिहितमप्यविज्ञातमविज्ञातार्थम् ॥ ९ ॥**

v. 2.9. *pariṣat<sup>47</sup>-pratīvādibhyāṃ triḥ abhīhitam api avijñātam*  
*avijñātārtham.*

47. NM : *pariṣat.*

*Parishat prati-vadibhyam triḥ abhi-hitam api avi-gyatam avi-gyat-artham.*

**GVB-10.** The meaning is indifferent if the construct does not distinguish the meanings based on other relations in the construct.

**पौरवापर्यायोगादप्रतिसंबद्धार्थमपार्थकम् ॥ १० ॥**

v. 2.10. *paurvāparya-ayogād<sup>48</sup> apratisambaddhārtham apārthakam.*

48. NM : *paurvāparya-ādi-yogād.*

*Paurv-apary-ayogat a-prati-sambandh-artham a-par-arthkam.*

**GVB-11.** A construct is premature if its parts are not suitably arranged.

**अव्यवविपर्यासवचनमप्राप्तकालम् ॥ ११ ॥**

v. 2.11. *avyava-viparyāsa-vacanam aprāpta-kālam.*

*Avyav viparyas vachanam a-prapt-kalam.*

**GVB-12.** Missing or superfluous parts weaken a construct.

**हीनमन्यतमेनाप्यव्यवेन न्यूनम् ॥ १२ ॥**

v. 2.12. *hinam anyatamena api avyavena nyūnam.*

*Hinam annya-tamen api avyaven nyunam.*

**GVB-13.** Excessive emphasis on relevance can be over-bearing (exasperating).

**हेतूदाहरणाधिकमधिकम् ॥ १३ ॥**

v. 2.13. *hetu-udāharāṇa-adhikam adhikam.*

*Hetu udaharan adhikam adhikam.*

**GVB-14.** Word and meaning are paraphrased in short if the construct is to be restated in a different context.

**शब्दार्थयोः पुनर्वचनं पुनरुक्तमन्यत्रानुवादात् ॥ १४ ॥**

v. 2.14. *śabdārthayoh punarvacanam punaruktam<sup>49</sup> anyatra*

*anuvādāt.*

49. NM : *punarvacanam.*

*Shabd-arth-yoh punarvachnam punah uktam anyatr anuvadat.*

**GVB-15.** Paraphrasing in ones own words is required if the meaning of the proposition is not accessible.

**अर्थादापन्नस्य स्वशब्देन पुनर्वचनम् ॥ १५ ॥**

v. 2.15. *arthād āpannam sv-aśabdena<sup>50</sup> punarvacanam.<sup>51</sup>*

50. NVi : *śadana*.

51. NVi, nvr, R, VSS : *abhidhānam*. NSN, NVTT, NV add  
*punaruktam*.

*Arthat a-pannasya sv-shabden punarvachnam.*

**GVB-16.** It is considered a lack of response if a request to repeat the argument (from a group of experts in a debate) is ignored three times.

**विज्ञातस्य परिषदा  
त्रिरभिहितस्याप्यप्रत्युच्चारणमननुभाषणम् ॥ १६ ॥**

v. 2.16. *vijñātasya pariśada<sup>52</sup> triḥ abhīhitasya api apratyuccāraṇam<sup>53</sup>  
ananubhāṣanam.*

52. NM : *parśadā*.

53. ASs, VSS, Bibl. Ind. : *anuccāraṇam*.

*Vigyatasya parishad trih abhi-hitasya api a-prati-uccharanam an-anubhashnam.*

**GVB-17.** A lack of response suggests lack of knowledge and familiarity (ignorance).

**अविज्ञातं चाज्ञानम् ॥ १७ ॥**

v. 2.17. *avijñātaṃ<sup>54</sup> ca ajñānam.*

54. NM : *avijñānam*.

*A-viyatam ch agyanam.*

**GVB-18.** Lack of understanding of the implication of a response is not impressive (convincing).

**उत्तरस्याप्रतिपत्तिरप्रतिभा ॥ १८ ॥**

v. 2.18. *uttarasya apratipattiḥ apratibhā.*

*Uttarasya a-pratipattiḥ a-pratibha.*

**GVB-19.** An argument is disconnected if it is interrupted with a narrative (diatribe?).

**कार्यव्यासङ्गात्कथाविच्छेदे विकल्पः ॥ १९ ॥**

v. 2.19. *kārya-vyāsaṅgāt kathā-vicchedaḥ vikṣepaḥ.*

*Karya vyasangat katha vicchedah vikchepah.*

**GVB-20.** It is a disregard for the opinion of others to elaborate weakness of the counter proposition when asked to address defects of ones own proposition.

**स्वपक्षदोषाभ्युपगमात् परपक्षे दोषप्रसङ्गे मतानुज्ञा ॥ २० ॥**

v. 2.20. *sva-pakṣe*<sup>55</sup> *doṣa-abhyupagamāt para-pakṣe*<sup>56</sup> *doṣa-prasaṅgaḥ*  
*matānujñā.*

55. Some read *sva-pakṣa-doṣa-* etc.

56. ASS, Bibl. Ind., VSS : *para-pakṣa-doṣa-*

*Sv-pakche dosh abhupgamat par-pakche dosh prasangah matanugya.*

**GVB-21.** A discredited proposition is not re-established by accusation and disregard for the concerns.

**निग्रहस्थानप्राप्तस्यानिग्रहः पर्यनुयोज्योपेक्षणम् ॥ २१ ॥**

v. 2.21. *nigraha-sthāna*<sup>57</sup>-*prāptasya anigrahaḥ paryanuyojya-*  
*upekṣaṇam.*

57. NM omits *sthāna*.

*Nigrah-sthan praptasya a-nigrahaḥ pari-anu-yojya upekchanam.*

**GVB-22.** It is unacceptable to invoke a proposition that has been discredited elsewhere.

**अनिग्रहस्थाने निग्रहस्थानाभियोगो  
निरनुयोज्यानुयोगः ॥ २२ ॥**

v. 2.22. *anigraha-sthāne nigraha-sthāna-abhiyogaḥ niranuyojya-*  
*anuyogaḥ.*

*A-nigrah-sthane nigrah-sthana-abiyogah niranuyogy-anuyogyah.*

**GVB-23.** It is against rules to introduce an assertion with a narrative about an unrelated established proposition.

**सिद्धान्तमभ्युपेत्यानियमात् कथाप्रसङ्गो ऽपसिद्धान्तः ॥ २३ ॥**

v. 2.23. *siddhāntam abhyupetya aniyamāt kathāprasāṅgaḥ*  
*apasiddhāntaḥ.*

*Siddhantam abhyupetya a-niyamat katha prasangah ap-siddhantah.*

**GVB-24.** Such a narrative is mere appearance of relevance.

**हेत्वाभासाश्च यथोक्ताः ॥ २४ ॥**

v. 2.24. *hetvābhāsāḥ ca yathoktāḥ.*

*Hetu-abhasah ch yathoktah.*

\*