

Affirmative Reasoning: Volume II (Part Four of Ten)

**Validation of Cognition Through Discourse**  
(Gautam's Nyaya Sutr)

**Chapter IIB**

**Concern About a Concept (*Pramey*)**

**GIIB-1.** It is not that there is shortage of evidence in the four oral traditions.

**Note:** The traditional oral *a priori* of the Vadang (scriptures of Ved, Smriti, Shastr and Puran) is considered god-given. The Vedant (literally post-Vedic -700 to -200c) work (Upnishad, and Samhita and Bhasya) is by human sages.

न चतुष्टयमैतिह्यार्थापत्तिसम्भवाभावप्रामाण्यात् ॥ १ ॥

ii. 2.1. *na catuṣṭyam aitiḥya-arthāpatti-sambhava-abhāva-ḥprāmāṇyāt.*

*Na chatushtyam aitiḥya arthat aapatti sambhav a-bhav pramanyat.*

***Liabilities in the words from the past***

**GIIB-2.** These words do not refute other possibilities. Also their meaning can not be used to affirm or deny other meanings.

शब्दयेतिह्यार्थान्तर्भावादानुमाने ऽर्थापत्तिसंभवाभावानर्थान्तरभावाच्चाप्रतिषेधः ॥ २ ॥

ii. 2.2. *śabda aitiḥya-anarthāntara-bhāvāt anumāne arthāpatti-sambhava-abhāva<sup>38</sup> anarthāntara-bhāvāt ca apratiṣedhaḥ.*

38. NVi, nvr : abhāvānām arthāntara...B,  
V : abhāvanām anarthāntare...

*Shabd aitiḥya anarthantar bhavat anumane arthat-aapatti sambhav abhav anarthantar bhavat ch a-pratishedhah.*

**GIIB-3.** Multiple interpretations and meanings also make it difficult to determine other relations.

अर्थापत्तिरप्रमाणमनैकान्तिकत्वात् ॥ ३ ॥

ii. 2.3. *arthāpattiḥ apramāṇam anaikāntikatvāt.*

*Arthat-aapattiḥ a-pramanam an-aikantikavāt.*

**GIIB-4.** Even the unintended possibilities can not be judged.

**अनर्थापत्तावर्थापत्यभिमानात् ॥ ४ ॥**

ii. 2.4. *anarthāpattau arthāpatti-abhimānāt.*<sup>39</sup>

39. R.: anarthāpatti-abhimānāt. Some read the *avataṛaṇikā* of the Nbh na anaikāntikatvam arthāpattēḥ as part of the sūtra.

*An-arthat-aapattau arthat-aapatti abhimanat.*

**GIIB-5, 6.** Without ability to falsify such words from the past are not significant to infer their valid meaning.

**प्रतिषेधाप्रामाण्यं चानैकान्तिकत्वात् ॥ ५ ॥**

ii. 2.5. *pratiṣedha-aprāmāṇyaṃ ca anaikāntikatvāt.*

*Pratishedh a-pramanyam ch anaikantikativat.*

**तत्प्रामाण्येवा नार्थापत्यप्रामाण्यम् ॥ ६ ॥**

ii. 2.6. *tat-prāmāṇye vā na arthāpatti-aprāmāṇyam.*

*Tat pramanye va na arthat-aapatti a-pramanyam.*

**GIIB-7.** This is not because in the absence of such evidence a basis to address concerns can not be established.

**नाभावप्रामाण्यं प्रमेयासिद्धेः ॥ ७ ॥**

ii. 2.7. *na abhāva-prāmāṇyaṃ prameya-asiddheḥ.*

*Na a-bhav pramanyam pramey a-siddheh.*

\*

*Accessible basis to address concern (pramey)*

**GIIB-8.** To establish a basis to address a concern one looks for the missing characteristics among its distinguishing characteristics. For identifying such characteristics one looks among the undefined characteristics.

**लक्षितेष्वलक्षणलक्षितत्वादलक्षितानां तत्प्रमेयसिद्धेः ॥ ८ ॥**

ii. 2.8. *lakṣiteṣu alakṣaṇa-lakṣitatvāt alakṣitānām tat-prameya-siddhiḥ.*<sup>40</sup>

40. VSS, ASS, NV, Bibl. Ind., B, R.: -siddheḥ.

*Lakchiteshu a-lakchan lakchitativat a-lakchitanam tat pramey siddheh.\*\**

**GIIB-9.** Meaning and distinguishing characteristics of the basis of a concern can not be communicated and examined unless the basis is tangible.

**असत्यर्थं नाभाव इति चेद् नान्यलक्षणोपपत्तेः ॥ ९ ॥**

ii. 2.9. *asati arthe na abhāvaḥ iti cet na anya-lakṣaṇa-upapatteḥ.*  
*A-sati arthe na a-bhave iti chet na annya lakchan uppatteh.*

**GIIB-10.** The basis of a concern can be established without defining its relevant characteristics.

**तत्सिद्धेरलक्षितेष्वहेतुः ॥ १० ॥**

ii. 2.10. *tat-siddheḥ alakṣiteṣu ahetuḥ.*  
*Tat siddheh a-lakchitesu a-hetuh.*

**GIIB-11.** It is not because the basis does not have organized characteristics.

**न लक्षणावस्थितापेक्षासिद्धेः ॥ ११ ॥**

ii. 2.11. *na lakṣaṇa-avasthita-apekṣā<sup>41</sup>-siddheḥ.*  
41. Though others read -apekṣā-, Phaṇibhūṣaṇa's reading agrees with NV, NSN, Bibl. Ind., nvr, R and NVi.  
*Na lakchan avasthit apekcha siddheh.*

**GIIB-12.** Also it is not because the basis was available in the past has disappeared since.

**प्रागुत्पत्तेरभावोपपत्तेश्च ॥ १२ ॥**

ii. 2.12. *prāk utpatteḥ abhāva-upapatteḥ ca.*  
*Prak utpatteh a-bhavah uppatteh ch.*

**GIIB-13.** A basis considered in the earlier opinions can be reasoned with suitable non-sensory devices.

**आदिमत्त्वादैनद्रियकत्वात्कृतकवदुपचाराच्च ॥ १३ ॥**

ii. 2.13. *ādimattuāt aindriyakatvāt kṛtakavat<sup>42</sup> upacārāt ca.<sup>43</sup>*  
42.. B, nvr : kṛtakāt  
43. NM adds : anityaḥ śabdaḥ. Same is the case with the beginning in NVr.  
*Adi mattvat a-indriyatvat kratakvat upcharat ch.*

**GIIB-14.** Ordinarily, if the pot is not seen at present may not have been there before. However, whether or not the absence is permanent is not beyond consideration forever.

**न घटाभावसामान्यनित्यत्वान्नित्येष्वप्यनित्यवदुपचाराच्च ॥ १४ ॥**

ii. 2.14. *na ghaṭābhāva-sāmānya-nityatvāt nityeṣu api<sup>44</sup> anityavat upacārāt ca.*  
44. ASS : kyacit.  
*Na ghat a-bhav samanya nityatvat nityeshu api anitya-vat upcharat ch.*

\*

**GIIB-15.** It is not a contradiction if the basis of a concern is considered in parts and in different ways [organized, divided, analyzed, classified, categorized].

**तत्त्वभाक्तयोर्नानात्वविभागादव्यभिचारः ॥ १५ ॥**

ii. 2.15. *tattva-bhāktayoḥ nānātvasya<sup>45</sup> vibhāgāt avyabhicāraḥ.*

45. Though others read nānātvā-vibhāgāt, Phaṇibhūṣaṇa's reading agrees with NV, NVTT, NSN, R, nvr, B, NVi and V.

*Tatv bhaktyoh nanatv-vibhagat a-vyabhicharah.*

**GIIB-16.** Derivative (implication) of a basis are inferred with particular consideration.

**सन्तानानुमानविशेषणात् ॥ १६ ॥**

ii. 2.16. *santāna-anumāna-viśeṣaṇāt.*

*Santan anuman visheshnat.*

**GIIB-17.** Even a word construct can provide a permanent and non-contradictory measure of the basis of the material world in space.

**कारणद्रव्यस्य प्रदेशशब्देनाभिधानाद्  
नित्येष्वप्यव्यभिचार इति ॥ १७ ॥**

ii. 2.17. *kāraṇa-dravyasya pradeśa<sup>46</sup>-śabdena abhidhānāt.<sup>47</sup>*

46. NVi : pradeśa-viśeṣa.

47. Nbh, NV add : nityeṣu api avyabhicāraḥ iti. Against this are NSN, NVTT, V, ChSS, R, nvr, B and NVi.

*Karan dravyasya pradesh shabden abhidhanat nityeshu api a-vyabhichar iti.*

**GIIB-18.** And such a basis is not obscured even if the prior description is not available.

**प्रागुच्चारणादनुपलब्धेरारवराणादनुपलब्धेश्च ॥ १८ ॥**

ii. 2.18. *prāk uccāraṇāt<sup>48</sup> anupalabdheḥ<sup>49</sup> āvaraṇādi-anupalabdheḥ ca<sup>50</sup>*

48. Though others read uccāraṇādi-anupalabdheḥ, Phaṇibhūṣaṇa's reading agrees with R, B, nvr, NVi, V, NSN, NV, VSS, and ChSS.

49. nvr, NVi and B : anupalambhāt.

50. B and nvr omit ca.

*Prak uccharanat anuplabdheh avaran-adi anuplabdheh ch.*

**GIIB-19.** Lack of a suitable description suggests that the basis is not available or is inaccessible for reasoning.

**तदनुपलब्धेरनुपलम्भादावरणोपपत्तिः ॥ १९ ॥**

ii. 2.19. *tat-anupalabdheḥ anupalambhāt āvaraṇa-upapattiḥ.<sup>51</sup>*

51. NVi, B, V and nvr : -upalabdhḥ.

*Tat anuplabdheh anuplambhat avaran uppattih.*

**GIIB-20.** An object will remain unknown if effort is not made to know it. A covered object is accessible to reasoning even if the reason for obscurity is not known.

**अनुपलम्भादप्यनुपलब्धिसद्भावान्नावरणानुपपत्तिरनुपलम्भात् ॥ २० ॥**

ii. 2.20. *anupalambhāt api*<sup>52</sup> *anupalabdhi-sadbhāvāt*<sup>53</sup> *na āvaraṇa-*  
*anupapattiḥ anupalambhāt.*<sup>54</sup>

52. R omits *api*.

53. Though others read *-sadbhāvavat*, Phāṇibhūṣaṇa's reading is in accordance with NSN, ChSS, VSS and ASS. V reads *sadbhāva-vat āvaraṇa...*

54. B and nvr drop this sūtra. NVr juxtaposes the sūtras 19 and 20.

*An-uplambhat api anupalabdhi sad-bhavat na avaran anuppattih an-uplambhat.*

**GIIB-21, 22.** Unavailability of the basis for direct examination is not relevant for further consideration of it.

**अनुपलम्भात्मकत्वादनुपलब्धेरहेतुः ॥ २१ ॥**

ii. 2.21. *anupalambhatmakatvāt anupalabdheḥ ahetuḥ.*

*Anupalabhatmaktvat an-uplabdheh a-hetuh.*

**अस्पर्शत्वात् ॥ २२ ॥**

ii. 2.22. *asparśatvāt.*

*A-sparashtvat.*

**GIIB-23.** It is not because such reasoning or consideration is not permanent.

**न कर्मानित्यत्वात् ॥ २३ ॥**

ii. 2.23. *na karma-anityatvāt.*

*Na karm a-nityatvat.*

**GIIB-24.** Nor is it because its parts are not permanent.

**नाणुनित्यत्वात् ॥ २४ ॥**

ii. 2.24. *na aṇu*<sup>55</sup>*-nityatvāt.*

55. VSS and ASS : *na aṇuḥ.*

*Na anu nityatvat.*

**GIIB-25, 26.** It is not relevant that the basis was given once and then it became unavailable forever.

**संप्रदानात् ॥ २५ ॥**

ii. 2.25. *sampradānāt.*<sup>56</sup>

56. NVi : *sampradānatvāt.*

*Sampradanat vat.*

**तदन्तरालानुपलब्धेरहेतुः ॥ २६ ॥**

ii. 2.26. *tat-antarāla-anupalabdheḥ ahetuḥ.*

*Tat antaraḥ anupalabdheḥ a-hetuḥ.*

\*

### *Refutation*

**GIIB-27.** There is little to refute if there is no difference of opinion.

**उभयोः पक्षयोरन्यतरस्याध्यापनादप्रतिषेधः ॥ २६ ॥**

ii. 2.28. *ubhayoḥ pakṣayoḥ anyatarasya adhyāpanāt apratiṣedhaḥ.*

*Ubhayoḥ pakṣayoḥ anyatarasya adhyapanāt a-pratiṣedhaḥ.*

**GIIB-28, 29.** Refutation may be used for practice (like being devil's advocate), however it is not a worthwhile exercise if there is no real difference.

**अभ्यासात् ॥ २९ ॥**

ii. 2.29. *abhyāsāt.*

*Abhyasat.*

**नान्यत्वे ऽप्यभ्यासस्योपचारात् ॥ २९ ॥**

ii. 2.30. *na<sup>57</sup> anyatve api abhyāsasya upacārāt.*

57. B and nvr omit na,

*Na anyatve api abhyasasya upcharat.*

**GIIB-30.** A characteristic that has little to do with an object may also be out of context (for the understanding of the object).

**अन्यदन्यस्मादनन्यत्वादनन्यदित्यन्यताऽभावः ॥ ३० ॥**

ii. 2.31. *anyat anyasmāt ananyatvāt ananyat iti anyatā-abhāvaḥ.*

*Annyat annysmat anannyatvat anannyat iti annyata a-bhavah.*

**GIIB-31.** If there is no difference in the basis, there is little difference between the two concerns that exist only in relation to each other (i.e. are not independent).

**तदभावे नास्त्यनन्यता तयोरितरेतरापेक्षसिद्धेः ॥ ३१ ॥**

ii. 2.32. *tat-abhāve na asti ananyatā tayoh itara-itara-apekṣa-siddheḥ.*

*Tat abhave na asti anannyata tayoh itar itar apekch-siddheh.*

**GIIB-32.** Also a difference of opinion does not exist if the basis for one or both the concerns can not be discarded (with suitable reasoning).

**विनाशकारणानुपलब्धेः ॥ ३२ ॥**

ii. 2.33. *vināśa-kāraṇa-anupalabdheḥ.<sup>58</sup>*

58. NSN adds ca.

*Vinash karan anupalabdheh ch.*

**GIIB-33.** One assumes that hearing is uninterrupted unless there is an identifiable reason for interruption.

**अश्रवणकारणानुपलब्धेः सततश्रवणप्रसङ्गः ॥ ३३ ॥**

ii. 2.34. *āśravaṇa-kāraṇa-anupalabdheḥ satata-śravaṇa prasāṅgaḥ.*

*A-shravan karan anuplabdheh satat shravan prasangah.*

**GIIB-34.** Otherwise, anything that is intangible, unknown or indescribable remains inaccessible to reasoning.

**उपलभ्यमाने चानुपलब्धेरसत्त्वादनपदेशः ॥ ३४ ॥**

ii. 2.35. *upalabhyamāne ca anupalabdheḥ asattvāt anapadeśaḥ.*<sup>59</sup>

59. R : anupadeśaḥ.

*Uplabhyamane ch anuplabdheh a-satvat an-apdeshah.*

**GIIB-35.** An object that exists but can not be completely identified with suitable words is not considered not-available for reasoning.

ii. 2.36. *pāṇi-nimitta-praśleṣāt śabda-abhāve na anupalabdhiḥ.*

*Pani nimitt preshleshat shabd a-bhave na anuplabdhih.*

**GIIB-36.** Continuity of the basis of a concern is assumed unless there is an identifiable basis for its loss.

**विनाशकारणानुपलब्धेश्चावस्थाने तन्नित्यत्वप्रसङ्गः ॥ ३६ ॥**

ii. 2.37. *vināśa-kāraṇa-anupalabdheḥ ca avasthāne tat-nityatva-prasāṅgaḥ.*

*Vinash karan anuplabdheh ch avasthane tat nityatv prasangah.*

**GIIB-37.** (However) Inability to examine can not be refuted.

**अस्पर्शत्वाद्प्रतिषेधः ॥ ३७ ॥**

ii. 2.38. *asparśatvāt apratiśedheḥ.*

*A-sparshatvat a-pratishedhah.*

\*

***Uncertainty and doubt in reasoning***

**GIIB-38, 39.** Defect in the verb form and compound words (grammatical defects) create doubt by introducing distortion in the particulars of assumption (*a-desh*) and interpretation (*up-desh*).

**विभक्त्यन्तरोपपत्तेश्च समासे ॥ ३८ ॥**

ii. 2.39. *vibhaktyanantara-upapatteḥ ca samāse.*

*Vibhakti-antarāh uppateh ch samase.*

**विकारादेशापदेशात्संशयः ॥ ३९ ॥**

ii. 2.40. *vikāra-ādeśa<sup>60</sup>-upadeśāt saṁśayah.*

60. B and nvr : -apadeśa-.

*Vikar adesh updeshat sanshyah.*

**GIIB-40.** Such defects increase with further consideration.

**प्रकृतिविवृद्धौ विकारवृद्धेः ॥ ४० ॥**

ii. 2.41. *prakṛti-vivṛddhau vikāra-vivṛddheḥ.<sup>61</sup>*

61. NSN (not in ChSS), nvr, B and NVi : vivṛddheḥ ca.  
VSS, ASS and ChSS : vṛddheḥ.

*Prakṛti vi-vradhau vikar vi-vraddheh ch.*

**GIIB-41.** It is irrelevant whether such distortion is superficial, or more, or less.

**न्यूनसमाधिकोपलब्ध्येर्विकारानामहेतुः ॥ ४१ ॥**

ii. 2.42. *nyūna-sama-adhika-upalabdheḥ<sup>62</sup> vikārāṇām ahetuḥ.*

62. B, nvr, NVi, R : -upapatteḥ

*Nyun sam adhik uplabdheh vikaranam a-hetuh.*

\*

*Analogy*

**GIIB-42.** Analogy (*drashtant*) remains relevant even if its basis for reasoning is not accessible or established for mutual consideration.

**द्विविधस्यापि हेतोरभावादसाधनं दृष्टान्तः ॥ ४१ ॥**

ii. 2.43. *dvi-vidhasya api hetoḥ abhāvāt asādhanam dṛṣṭāntaḥ.<sup>63</sup>*

63. NSN, ChSS and NV do not mention this sūtra at all.

*Dvi-vidhasya api hetoh a-bhavat a-sadhanam drashtantah.*

**GIIB-42a.** It is not because not-comparable natural behaviors do not suffer from defects of ambiguity.

**नातुल्यप्रकृतीनां विकारविकल्पात् ॥ ४२ ॥**

ii. 2.44. *na atulya-prakṛtīnām vikāra vikalpāt.*

*Na a-tulya prakratinam vikar vikalpat.*

**GIIB-43.** Ambiguity in an analogy results from confusion about dissimilarity of the content and form.

**द्रव्यविकारे वैषम्यवद् वर्णविकारविकल्पः ॥ ४३ ॥**

ii. 2.45. *dravya-vikāra<sup>64</sup>-vaiṣamyavat varṇa-vikāra-vikalpaḥ.*<sup>65</sup>

64. Though others read dravya-vikāre vaiṣamyavat,  
Phañibhūṣaṇa's reading agrees with R, B,  
NSN, NV, NVi and nvr.

65. nvr and B : vikāra-avikalpaḥ.

*Dravya vikarah vai-samyvat varṇa vikar vikalpaḥ.*

**GIIB-44.** It is not a defect of the behavior that is the basis of comparison.

**न विकारधर्मानुपपत्तेः ॥ ४४ ॥**

ii. 2.46. *na vikāra-dharma-anupapatteḥ.*

*Na vikar dharm anupatteḥ.*

**GIIB-45.** There is no point in dwelling on such defects.

**विकारप्राप्तानामपुनरापत्तेः ॥ ४५ ॥**

ii. 2.47. *vikāra-prāptānām a-punaḥ-āpatteḥ.*<sup>66</sup>

66. R, B, nvr, Bibl. Ind. and B : -āpatteḥ.

*Vikar prapta-nam a-punaḥ apatteḥ.*

**GIIB-46.** It is not relevant to repeatedly examine defective gold for defects.

**GIIB-46a.** This is not because defects (impurities) are not associated with the state of the gold.

**सुवर्णादीनां पुनरापत्तेरहेतुः ॥ ४६ ॥**

ii. 2.48. *suvarṇādīnām punaḥ āpatteḥ ahetuḥ.*

*Suvarṇ-adinam punaḥ apatteḥ a-hetuḥ.*

**न तद्विकाराणां सुवर्ण भावाव्यतिरेकात् ॥ ४६ ॥**

ii. 2.49. *na tat-vikārāṇām suvarṇa-bhāva-avyatirekāḥ.*

*Na tat vikaranam suvarṇa bhava-avyatirekat.*

**GIIB-47.** An object is naturally without defects, whereas irrespective of the state defects are not.

**नित्यत्वे विकारादनित्यत्वे चानवस्थानात् ॥ ४७ ॥**

ii. 2.50. *nityatve avikārāt<sup>67</sup> anityatve ca anavasthānāt.*

67. Bibl. Ind. and nvr drop the *avagraha* after *nityatve* which amounts to the reading : *nityatve vikārāt.*

*Nityatve a-vikarat a-nityatve ch an-avasthanat.*

\*

### Defects and Refutation

**GIIB-48.** Defect of the form can not be refuted if the defect is permanent and its behavior is ambiguous.

**नित्यानामतीन्द्रियत्वात्तदुर्मविकल्पाच्च वर्णविकाराणामप्रतिषेधः ॥ ४८ ॥**

ii. 2.51. *nityānām<sup>68</sup> atīndriyatvāt tat<sup>69</sup>-dharmā-vikalpāt ca varṇa-  
vikārāṇām apratiṣedhaḥ.*

68. NV adds api.

69. B, nvr and NVi omit tat.

*Nityanam ati-indriyatvat tat dharm-vikalpat ch varn-vikaranam apratishedhah.*

**GIIB-49.** Defect in form is interpreted with the grasp of the altered state.

**अनवस्थायित्वे च वर्णापलब्धिवत्तद्विकारोपपत्तिः ॥ ४९ ॥**

ii. 2.52. *anavasthāyitve ca varṇa-upalabdhiivat tat vikāra<sup>70</sup>-upapattih.*

70. R, B, nvr and NVi omit vikāra.

*An-avasthayitve ch varn uplabdhivat tat vikarah uppattih.*

**GIIB-50.** It can not be refuted that defective behavior may not be apparent or emerge later.

**विकारधर्मित्वे नित्यत्वाभावात् कालान्तरे  
विकारोपपत्तेश्चाप्रतिषेधः ॥ ५० ॥**

ii. 2.53. *vikāra-dharmitve<sup>71</sup> nityatva-abhāvāt kālāntare vikāra-  
upapatteḥ ca apratiṣedhaḥ.*

71. NVT: -dharmatve.

*Vikar dharmitve nityatv a-bhavat kal-antare vikarah uppatteḥ ch a-pratishedhah.*

\*

### Irregularity

**GIIB-51.** Defects of form are not naturally rule-bound.

**प्रकृत्यनियमाद्वर्णविकाराणाम् ॥ ५१ ॥**

ii. 2.54. *prakṛti-anīyamāt.<sup>72</sup>*

72. Though others add at the end the expression varṇa-  
vikārāṇām, Phaṇibhūṣaṇa's reading agrees with  
R, B, nvr, NVi, and NSN.

*Prakṛti a-nīyamat varn vikaranam.*

**GIIB-52.** Irregularity of defect is the rule, and not a violation of rule.

**अनियमे नियमान्नानियमः ॥ ५२ ॥**

ii. 2.55. *aniyame niyamāt na aniyamah.*

*A-niyame niyamat na a-niyamah.*

**GIIB-53.** In such cases it can not be refuted that there may be rules that oppose the rules, and lack of rule may be the rule.

**नियमानियमविरोधादनियमे नियमाच्चाप्रतिषेधः ॥ ५३ ॥**

ii. 2.56. *niyama-aniyama-virodhāt aniyame niyamāt ca apratiṣedhah.*

*Niyam a-niyam-virodhat a-niyame niyamat ch a-pratishedhah.*

**GIIB-54.** Defect may introduce a change in the form or color, if the change is not due to manipulation, decrease or increase of content, addition or removal of parts.

**गुणान्तरापत्त्युपमर्दं ह्रासवृद्धिलेशश्लेषेभ्यस्तु  
विकारोपपत्तेर्बर्णविकाराः ॥ ५४ ॥**

ii. 2.57. *guṇāntarāpatti-upamardda-hrāsa-vṛddhi-leśa-śleṣebhyaḥ tu  
vikāra<sup>73</sup>-upapatteḥ varṇa-vikārāḥ.<sup>74</sup>*

73. B, nvr, ASS and VSS : varṇa-vikāra-.

74. R. VSS, NV, NSN, B, nvr, NVi and Bibl. Ind. : vikārah.

NV reads santi vikārāḥ. R reads : tu varṇa-vikārāḥ.

*Gun-antar aapatti upmard hras vraddhi lesh shleshebhyah tu vikarah uppatteh varn  
vikarah.*

\*

### *Defects of expression and reasoning*

**GIIB-55.** Each step of reasoning requires a proper ending, like the endings of noun and verb forms.

**ते विभक्त्यन्ताः पदम् ॥ ५५ ॥**

ii. 2.58. *te vibhaktyantāḥ padam.*

*Te vibhakti-antah padam.*

**GIIB-56.** Uncertainty in an expression arises if the intended relationship of subject, object, form and class is not suitably expressed in the sentence.

**तदर्थं व्यक्त्याकृतिजातिसन्निधावुपचारात्संशयः ॥ ५६ ॥**

ii. 2.59. *vyakti-ākṛti-jāti-sannidhau upacārāt saṁśayah.*

*Tat arthe vyakti akrati jati sannidhau upcharat sanshyah.*

**GIIB-57.** Uncertainty in an expression arises if the words order is lost, or additional words are added, or the form is over- or under-stated (redundant or superfluous).

याशब्दसमूहत्यागपरिग्रहसंख्यावृद्ध्युपचयवर्णसमासानुब-  
न्धानां व्यक्तावुपचाराद्व्यक्तिः ॥ ५७ ॥

- ii. 2.60. *yāśabda-samūha-tyāga-parigraha-samkhyā-vṛddhi-apacaya*<sup>75</sup>-  
*varṇa-samāsa-anuvandhānām vyaktau upacārat vyaktiḥ.*  
75. ASS, NV, NSN, V, Bibl. Ind.. VSS and R : -upacaya.

*Ya shabd samuh tyag parigrah sankhya vraddhi upchaya varn samas anu-bandhanam  
vyaktau upcharat vyaktih.*

**GIIB-58.** This is not because the expression has changed.

न तदनवस्थानात् ॥ ५८ ॥

- ii. 2.61. *na*<sup>76</sup> *tat-anavasthānāt.*  
76. R, B and nvr omit na.

*Na tat an-avasthanat.*

**GIIB-59.** (For example) Consider intention, meaning, scope, and associations communicated by the following words: Brahmin, stage, bracelet, king, gruel, sandalwood-paste, Ganga river, or women's garment. These words communicate only the conduct of a wandering mendicant without adequate understanding and goal.

**Note:** Words communicate specific intention only if organized in a suitable narrative.

सहचरसास्थानतादर्थ्यवृत्तमानधारणसा-  
मीप्ययोगसाधनाधिपत्येभ्यो ब्राह्मणमञ्जुकटराजसक्तुचन्द-  
नगङ्गाशटकान्नपुरुषेष्वतद्भावे ऽपि तदुपचारः ॥ ५९ ॥

- ii. 2.62. *sahacaraṇa-sthāna-tādarthya-vṛtta-māna-dhāraṇa-sāmīpya-*  
*yoga-sādhana-ādhipatyebhyaḥ brāhmaṇa-mañca-kaṭa-*  
*rāja-saktu*<sup>77</sup>-*candana-gaṅgā-ṣaṭaka*<sup>78</sup>-*anna-puruṣeṣu*  
*a-tat-bhāve api tat-upacārah.*

77. R, Bibl. Ind., nvr, NVi and V : śaktu.

78. NV, NVr, nvr, B and ASS : śakaṭa; NSN and  
NVi : śākaṭa.

*Sah-charan sthan tat arthya vratt-man dharan sameepya yog sadhan aadhipatye-bhyah.  
Brahman manch kat raj saktu chandan ganga shatakata na purusheshu a-tat bhava api tat  
upcharah.*

**GIIB-60.** Organization of the content establishes the expressed form.

आकृतिस्तदपेक्षत्वात् सत्त्वव्यवस्थानसिद्धेः ॥ ६० ॥

- ii. 2.63. *ākṛtiḥ tat-apekṣatvāt sattva-vyavasthāna-siddheḥ.*

*Akrtih tat apekchatvat satv vyavasthan siddheh.*

**GIIB-61.** Without a suitable context even a properly expressed form is like a toy cow made of clay that communicates only the class or category.

**व्यक्त्याकृतियुक्ते ऽप्यप्रसङ्गात्  
प्रोक्षणादीनां मृद्गवके जातिः ॥ ६१ ॥**

ii. 2.64. *vyakti-ākṛti-yukte api aprasaṅgāt prokṣaṇādīnām mṛdgavake jātiḥ.*

*Vyakti akrati yukte api aprasangat prokchan-adinam mrad-gavake jatih.*

**GIIB-62.** This is not to say that class is not communicated by a suitably expressed form.

**नाकृतिव्यक्त्यपेक्षत्वाज्जात्यभिव्यक्तेः ॥ ६२ ॥**

ii. 2.65. *na ākṛti vyakti-apekṣatvāt jāti-abhivyakteḥ.*<sup>79</sup>  
79. NVi adds ca.

*Na akrati vyakti apekchatvat jati abhivyakte.*

**GIIB-63.** Words, form, and class are all components of the content of expression.

**व्यक्त्याकृतिजातयस्तु पदार्थः ॥ ६३ ॥**

ii. 2.66. *vyakti-ākṛti-jātayah<sup>80</sup> tu padārthah.*  
80. NVi, R, B and nvr : jāti-ākṛti-vyaktayah.

*Vyakti akrati jatyah tu padarthah.*

**GIIB-64.** An image (idol, statue, picture) also expresses a particular quality of the represented individual.

**व्यक्तिगुणविशेषाश्रयो मूर्तिः ॥ ६४ ॥**

ii. 2.67. *vyaktiḥ guṇa-viśeṣa-āśrayā mūrtiḥ.*

*Vyaktih gun-vishesh ashryah murtih.*

**GIIB-65.** Form of a clear narrative builds on the expression of the class and its distinguishing attributes.

**आकृतिर्जातिलिङ्गाख्या ॥ ६५ ॥**

ii. 2.68. *ākṛtiḥ jāti-liṅga-ākhyā.*

*Akratih jati ling akhya.*

**GIIB-66.** Each member of a class has a common mother but its own defining attributes.

**समानप्रसवात्मिका जातिः ॥ ६६ ॥**

ii. 2.69. *samāna-prasavātmikā jātiḥ.*

*Saman prasav-atmika jatih.*

\*\*\*\*