

Affirmative Reasoning: Volume II (Part Five of Ten)

**Validation of Cognition Through Discourse  
(Gautam's Nyay Sutr)**

**Chapter IIIA**

**Insight (*Darshan*) and Understanding**

Insight (*darshan*) is like a wrap. Skin wraps organs of an organism that together integrate the sense-inputs with past experience. Inference of fire from the sight of smoke is also a wrap of relations. However, *a book is not to be judged from its cover or wrapper.* Relevance and potential liabilities of insights emerge with active reasoning. Philosophical insights build on beliefs and values that help us comprehend aspects of the whole even if all parts are not identifiable.

**GIIA-1.** Both insight and reasoning provide grasp of the same meaning.

**दर्शनस्पर्शनाभ्यामेकार्थग्रहणात् ॥ १ ॥**

iii. 1.1. *darśana-sparśanābhyām ekārtha-grahaṇāt.*

*Darshan sparshnabhyam ek arth grahanat.*

**GIIA-3.** It can not be refuted that both organize understanding.

**तद्व्यवस्थानादेवात्मसद्भावादप्रतिषेधः ॥ ३ ॥**

iii. 1.3. *tad-vyavasthānād eva ātma-sadbhāvād apratiśedhaḥ.*

*Tat vyavasthanat ev atm sad-bhavat a-pratishedhah.*

**GIIA-2.** It is not because the underlying subject is related to the organization.

**न विषयव्यवस्थानात् ॥ २ ॥**

iii. 1.2. *na, viśaya-vyavasthānāt.*

*Na vishay vyavasthanat.*

**GIHA-4, 5.** Nor is it because burning the body (structure of the subject) removes the wrong-doer (i.e. mis-understanding), yet mis-understanding persist even if the 'body is burnt alive.'

**शरीरदाहे पातकाभावात् ॥ ४ ॥**

iii. 1.4. *śarīra-dāhe pātakābhāvāt.*

*Sharir dahe patak a-bhavat.*

**तदभावः सात्मकप्रदाहे ऽपि तन्नित्यत्वात् ॥ ५ ॥**

iii. 1.5. *tad-abhāvaḥ sātma<sup>1</sup>-pradāhe api tan-nityatvāt.*

1. R : sātma-

*Tat a-bhavah sa-atmak pradāhe api tat nityatvat.*

**GIHA-6.** (Also) Wrong reasoning is not disposed off by killing the person whose reasoning is wrong.

**न कार्याश्रयकर्तृवधात् ॥ ६ ॥**

iii. 1.6. *na, kāryāśraya-kartṛ-vadhāt.<sup>2</sup>*

2. NVi : bādhat. NVr : bodhat. Bibl. Ind., nvr, B : badhat.

*Na karya ashray kartr badhat.*

\*

*Understanding: Cognition of the whole*

**GIHA-7.** Insight is different than *Pratyabhigyan*, the cognition based on all parts and relations.

**सव्यदृष्टस्येतरेण प्रत्यभिज्ञानात् ॥ ७ ॥**

iii. 1.7. *savya<sup>3</sup>-dr̥ṣṭasya itareṇā pratyabhijñānāt.*

3. B, nvr : savyena.

*Savya drashtasya itaren pratyabhi-gyanat.*

**GIHA-8.** Such a distinction is like the dual nasal airway.

**नैकस्मिन्नासास्थिव्यवहिते द्वित्वाभिमानात् ॥ ८ ॥**

iii. 1.8. *na, ekasmin nāsāsthi-vyavahite dvitvābhimānāt.*

*Na ekasmin nasa-asthi vyavhite dvitv-abhimanat.*

**GIHA-9.** Unity is not achieved by destroying one part of this duality.

**एकविनाशे द्वितीयाविनाशान्नैकत्वम् ॥ ९ ॥**

iii. 1.9. *eka-vināśe<sup>4</sup> dvitīyavināśāt na eka vam.*

4. R, B, nvr : nāśe.

*Ek vinashe dvitiy a-vinashat na ekatvam.*

**GIHA-10.** The whole inference is not relevant without its parts, yet inference is not refuted by opposing the analogy.

**अवयवनाशे ऽप्यवयव्युपलब्धेरहेतुः ॥ १० ॥**

iii. 1.10. *avayava-nāṣe-api avayavi-upalabdher ahetuḥ.*

*Avyav nashe api avyavi uplabdheh a-hetuḥ.*

**दृष्टान्तविरोधादप्रतिषेधः ॥ ११ ॥**

iii. 1.11. *dr̥ṣṭānta-virodhāt apratiṣedhaḥ.*

*Drashtant virodhat a-pratishedhah.*

**GIHA-12.** Experience is not refuted by defective sense inputs, nor the memorized subject is refuted by lack of recall.

**इन्द्रियान्तरविकारात् ॥ १२ ॥**

iii. 1.12. *indriyāntara-vikārāt.*

*Indriy-antar vikarat.*

**न स्मृतेः स्मर्तव्यविषयत्वात् ॥ १३ ॥**

iii. 1.13. *na, smṛteḥ smartavya viṣayatvāt.*

*Na smrteḥ smartavya vishaytvat.*

**GIHA-15.** There are countless memorable subjects.

**अपरिसंख्यानाञ्च स्मृतिविषयस्य ॥ १५ ॥**

*A-pari sankhyanat ch smrati vishayasya.*

**GIHA-14.** Yet it can not be refuted that their understanding is a quality of the individual.

**तदात्मगुणसद्भावादप्रतिषेधः ॥ १४ ॥**

iii. 1.14. *tadātma-guṇatva<sup>5</sup>-sadbhāvād apratiṣedhaḥ.*

5. Though others read *guṇa*, Phaṇibhūṣaṇa's reading agrees with NSN. R, B, nvr and NVi.

*Tat atm guṇ sadbhavat a-pratishedhah.*

**GIHA-16.** This is not because understanding and reasoning (intellect) by the individual is relevant to a particular interpretation.

**नात्मप्रतिपत्तिहेतूनां मनसि संभवात् ॥ १६ ॥**

iii. 1.15. *na, ātma-pratipatti-hetūnām manasi sambhavāt.*

*Na atm pratipatti hetunam manasi sambhvat.*

**GIIA-17.** (It is because) The way information is identified and defined by individuals facilitates interpretation cognitive understanding and communication.

**ज्ञातुर्ज्ञानसाधनोपपत्तेः संज्ञाभेदमात्रम् ॥ १७ ॥**

iii. 1.16. *jñātur jñāna-sādhana-upapatteh samjñā-bheda-mātram.*  
*Gyatuh gyan sadhan uppattēh sangya bhed matram.*

\*

### *Influences on understanding*

**GIIA-18.** What is inferred and interpreted from organized information is rule bound.

**नियमश्च निरनुमानः ॥ १८ ॥**

iii. 1.17. *niyamaś ca niranumānaḥ.*  
*Niyamah ch nir-anumanah.*

**GIIA-19.** Experience of happiness, fear and sadness is superficially associated with prior habits and memories.

**पूर्वाभ्यस्तस्मृत्यनुबन्धाज्जातस्य हर्षभयशोकसंप्रतिपत्तेः ॥ १९ ॥**

iii. 1.18. *pūrvābhyasta-smṛtyanubandhāj jātasya harṣa-bhaya-śoka-*  
*sampratipatteh.*  
*Purv abhyast smrti-anubandhat jatasya harsh bhay shok sam-pratipatteh.*

**GIIA-20.** Such changes are like the opening and closing of lotus flower (natural cycle).

**पद्मादिषु प्रबोधसंमीलनविकारवत्तद्विकारः ॥ २० ॥**

iii. 1.19. *padmādiṣu prabodha-sammīlana<sup>6</sup>-vikāravat tad<sup>7</sup>-vikārah.<sup>8</sup>*  
6. R : milanavat tad-. 7. ASS omits tad.  
8. NVi : tad-upapatteh.

*Padm-adishu prabodh sammilan vikarvat tat vikarah.*

**GIIA-21.** It is not because heat, cold, rain and time do not influence the relationship of the basic elements and space to bring about the changes.

**नाष्णशीतवर्षकालनिमित्त्वात् पञ्चात्मकविकाराणाम् ॥ २१ ॥**

iii. 1.20. *na, uṣṇa-śīta-varṣā<sup>9</sup>-kāla-nimittatvāt pañcātma-*  
*vikārāṇam.*

9. Others read *varṣa*. The present reading agrees with ChSS, ASS, Bibl. Ind., R, B, nvr and NVi.

*Na ushn sheet varsh kal nimitatvat panch atmak vikaranam.*

**GIIA-22.** Desire for mother's milk is instinctive need for nutrition.

**प्रेत्याहाराभ्यासकृतात् स्तन्याभिलाषात् ॥ २२ ॥**

iii. 1.21. *pretyāhārābhyāsa-kṛtāt stanyābhilāṣāt.*

*Pretya ahar abhyas kratat stanya abhilashat.*

**GIIA-23.** Such instincts are like the ability of a magnet to attract iron.

**अयसो ऽयस्कान्ताभिगमनवत्तदुपसर्पणम् ॥ २३ ॥**

iii. 1.22. *ayasah ayaskāntābhigamanavat tadupasarpṇam.*

*Ayasah ayaskant abhi-gaman-vat tat upsarpanam.*

**GIIA-24.** This is not because such (instinctive) tendencies are not found elsewhere.

**नान्यत्र प्रवृत्त्यभावात् ॥ २४ ॥**

iii. 1.23. *na, anyatra pravṛttyabhāvāt.*

*Na annyatr pravradi a-bhavat.*

**GIIA-25.** Lack of expectation is not seen at birth [*i.e. expectations are inborn and instinctive, and subject to later influences*].

**वीतरागजन्मादर्शनात् ॥ २५ ॥**

iii. 1.24. *vītarāga janm adarśanāt.*

*Veet-rag janm a-darshnat.*

**GIIA-26.** Expectations are inborn quality of the content of living organism.

**सगुणद्रव्योत्पत्तिवत्तदुत्पत्तिः ॥ २६ ॥**

iii. 1.25. *saguna-dravyotpattivat tadutpattiḥ.*

*Sa-gun dravya utpattivat tat utpattiḥ.*

**GIIA-27.** This is not to say that expectations are not influenced with deliberate action.

**न संकल्पनिमित्तत्वाद्वागादीनाम् ॥ २७ ॥**

iii. 1.26. *na, saṅkalpa-nimittatvād vāgādīnām.*

*Na sankalp nimittvat ragadinam.*

\*

**Steps (#28-38) in this box and later after #60 elaborate a physical basis for the change. Material basis for existence follows from the conservation principle of Rishabhanath. Basis for spontaneous physical change began is developed in the Vaishesik tradition possibly started by Kapil (ca 500 BCE). It later emerged as the Nyay-Vaishesik tradition**

*that apparent in the Vatsyayan's commentary (ca 400 CE) that elaborates on the physical nature of sound (apparent in #61-73) and the apoh theory (ca. 600 CE).*

**GIIIA-28.** A physical change results in a change in quality (tendency and habit).

**पार्थिवं गुणान्तरोपलब्धेः ॥ २८ ॥**

iii. 1.27. *pārthivam guṇāntara<sup>10</sup>-upalabdheḥ*

10. Śaṅkara Miśra (on *Vaiśeṣika-sūtra* 4.2.4) reads *tad-viśeṣaguṇa*.

*Parthivam gun antar uplabdheh.*

**GIII-28a.** (For example) Certain properties emerge from a certain combination of water and fire (elements).

**पार्थिवाप्यतैजसं तद्गुणोपलब्धेः ॥ ॥**

iii. 1.28. *pārthiva-āpya-taijasam tad-guṇa-upalabdheḥ.*<sup>11</sup>

11. Some do not read the present and the following two as *sūtra*-s. They are, however, included as *sūtra*-s in NSN, ASS, ChSS, NVr, B, R, and NVi.

*Parthiv apya tejasam tad gun uplabdheh.*

**GIII-28b.** The overall balance of the four component elements depends on what we inhale and exhale [*i.e. the balance of what is taken in and given out*].

**निःश्वासोच्छ्वासोपलब्धेश्चातुर्भौतिकम् ॥ ॥**

iii. 1.29. *niḥśvāsa-ucchvāsa-upalabdheś cāturbhautikam.*

*Nih shvasah ucchshvasah uplabdheh chaturbhautikam.*

**GIII-28c.** Odor, taste, digestions, and excretion are related to such elemental changes.

**गन्धक्लेदपाकव्यूहावकाशदानेभ्यः पञ्चभौतिकम् ॥ ॥**

iii. 1.30. *gandha-kleda-pāka-vyūha-avakāśadānebhyah pañcabhautikam.*

*Gandh kled pak vyuh avkash-danenbhyah panch-bhautikam.*

**GIIIA-35.** Emergence of distinguishing qualities and behaviors of a physical being is rule-based.

**द्रव्यगुणधर्मभेदाच्चोपलब्धिनियमः ॥ ३५ ॥**

iii. 1.37. *dravya-guṇa-dharma-bhedāc ca upalabdhi-niyamaḥ.*<sup>14</sup>

14. NVi and ChSS : *aniyamaḥ*

*Dravya gun dharm bhedah ch uplabdhi niymah.*

**GIIIA-36.** Particular forms emerge from a combination of different substances in particular ways.

अनेकद्रव्यसमवायाद् रूपविशेषाच्च रूपोपलब्धिः ॥ ३६ ॥

iii. 1.38. *aneka-dravya-samavāyād rūpa-viśeṣāc ca rūpa-upalabdhiḥ.*<sup>15</sup>  
15. cf. *Vaiśeṣika-sūtra* 4.1.8.

*Anek dravya samvayat rup vishesha ch rup uplabdhih.*

**GIIA-37.** Strategic thinking is required to coordinate sense experience and reason about how individual forms evolve.

कर्मकारितश्चेन्द्रियाणां व्यूहः पुरुषार्थतन्त्रः ॥ ३७ ॥

iii. 1.39. *karmakāritaś ca indriyāṇāṃ vyūhaḥ puruṣārtha-tantraḥ.*

*Karm karitah ch indriyanam vyuhah purush-arth tantrah.*

**GIIA-38.** (And such) Physical behavior is neither violated nor contradictory.

अव्यभिचाराच्च प्रतिघातो भौतिकधर्मः ॥ ३८ ॥

*A-bvabhichara ch pratighatah bhautic dharmah.*

\*

### *Limitations of senses for understanding*

**GIIA-29.** *Shruti* (Oral tradition as scripture) is used to validate understanding.

श्रुतिप्रामाण्याच्च ॥ २९ ॥

iii. 1.31. *śruti-ṣrāmāṇyāc ca.*

*Shruti pramanyat ch.*

**GIIA-30.** Doubt and uncertainty is inherent in understanding about an unknown object in the dark that is not accessible for direct examination.

कृष्णसारे सत्युपलम्भाद्व्यतिरिच्य चोपलम्भात्संशयः ॥ ३० ॥

iii. 1.32. *kr̥ṣṇasāre sati upalambhād vyatiricya ca upalambhāt*  
*saṃśayaḥ.*

*Krshn sare sati uplambhat vyati-richya ch uplambhat sanshayah.*

**GIIA-31.** Uncertainty is also inherent in the grasp of enormous or microscopic objects.

महदणुग्रहणात् ॥ ३१ ॥

iii. 1.33. *mahad-aṇu-grahaṇāt.*<sup>12</sup>

12. R : *mahad-agrahaṇāt.* NVi : *anugrahaṇāt.*

*Mahat anu grahnat.*

**GIHA-32.** Such objects are grasped from the meaning of a particular view.

**रश्म्यर्थसन्निकर्षविशेषात्तद्ग्रहणम् ॥ ३२ ॥**

iii. 1.34. *raśmyartha-sannikarṣaviśeṣāt<sup>13</sup> tad grahaṇam.*  
13. B and nvr : *sannikarṣāt tad*

*Rashmi-arth sannikarsh visheshat tat grahnam.*

**GIHA-33.** It is not relevant whether such objects are accessible to reasoning.

**तदनुपलब्धेरहेतुः ॥ ३३ ॥**

iii. 1.35. *tad-anupalabdher ahetuḥ.*

*Tat anuplabdheh ahetuh.*

**GIHA-34.** It is not because ability to examine is relevant for evidence-based inference.

**नानुमीयमानस्य प्रत्यक्षतो ऽनुपलब्धिरभावहेतुः ॥ ३४ ॥**

iii. 1.36. *na anumīyamānasya pratyakṣataḥ anupalabdhir abhāva-*  
*hetuḥ.*

*Na anumiymansya pratykchatah anuplabdhih abhav hetuh.*

**GIHA-39.** (For example) Light of a falling star is not seen in mid-day. This is not because the light of falling stars is available only at night.

**मध्यन्दिनोल्काप्रकाशानुपलब्धिश्चतदनुपलब्धिः ॥ ३९ ॥**

iii. 1.40. *madhyandina-ulkā-prakāśa-anupalabdhivat tad-*  
*anupalabdhīḥ.*

*Madhyanh-din ulka prakash anuplabdhivat tat anuplabdhih.*

**न रात्रावप्यनुपलब्धिः ॥ ४० ॥**

iii. 1.41. *na, rātrau api anupalabdheḥ.*

*Na ratrau api anuplabdheh.*

\*

***Insight facilitates understanding***

**GIHA-41.** An individual may find a subject inaccessible, or may not be able to elaborate its understanding without external light.

**बाह्यप्रकाशानुग्रहाद्  
विषयोपलब्धेरनभिव्यक्तितो ऽनुपलब्धिः ॥ ४१ ॥**

iii. 1.42. *vāhya-prakāśa-anugrahād viśaya-upalabdher anabhi-vyaktitah*  
*anupalabdhīḥ.*

*Vahya prakash anu-grahat vishay uplabdheh an-abhi-vyaktitah anuplabdhih.*

**GIHA-42.** Such limitations (of awareness) also apply for acknowledging existence of an object or for elaborating its significance.

**अभिव्यक्तौ चाभिभवात् ॥ ४२ ॥**

iii. 1.43. *abhivyaktau ca abhibhavāt.*

*Abhi-vyaktau ch abhi-bhavat.*

**GIHA-43.** (For example) Night-crawlers see in dim light [*i.e. people differ in their abilities to understand obscure subjects*].

**नक्तंचरनयनरश्मिदर्शनाच्च ॥ ४३ ॥**

iii. 1.44. *naktañcara-nayana<sup>16</sup>-raśmi-darśanāc ca.*

16. B and nvr omit *nayana*.

*Naktam-char nayan rashmi darshnat ch.*

**GIHA-44.** Sometimes an inaccessible object can be examined with devices of glass, mica-plate, or quartz. [*Possible reference to tools such as a magnifying lens and mirror.*]

**अप्राप्यग्रहणं काचाभ्रपटलस्फटिकान्तरितापलब्धेः ॥ ४४ ॥**

iii. 1.45. *apṛāpya-grahaṇaṃ kāca-abhrapaṭala-sphaṭikāntarita-  
upalabdheḥ.*

*A-prapya grahnam kach abhr-patal spahatik antarit uplabhdheh.*

**GIHA-45.** An object behind a wall can not be refuted.

**कुड्यान्तरितानुपलब्धेरप्रतिषेधः ॥ ४५ ॥**

iii. 1.46. *kudyañtaritānupalabdher apratiṣedhaḥ.*

*Kudya antrit anuplabdheh a-pratishedhah.*

**GIHA-46.** Its presence is validated after removing the wall.

**अप्रतीघातात्सन्निकर्षोपपत्तिः ॥ ४६ ॥**

iii. 1.47. *apratighātāt sannikarṣa-upapattiḥ.<sup>17</sup>*

17. R, B and nvr : *upattiḥ.*

*A-pratighatat sannikarshah uppattiḥ.*

**GIHA-47.** Sunlight becomes hotter and brighter after passing through quartz (lens).

**आदित्यरश्मेः स्फटिकान्तरिते ऽपि**

**दाह्ये ऽविघातात् ॥ ४७ ॥**

iii. 1.48. *ādityārasmeh sphaṭikāntare*<sup>18</sup> *api dāhye avighātāt*.<sup>19</sup>

18. Others read *sphaṭikāntarite*. The present reading agrees with ASS, VSS, Bibl. Ind. and R.

19. NVi : *abhighātāt*.

*Aditya rashmeh sphaṭikāntare api dāhye avi-ghātāt.*

**GIIA-48.** This is not because behaviors change with context.

**नेतरतरधर्मप्रसङ्गात् ॥ ४८ ॥**

iii. 1.49. *na, itaretara-dharma-prasaṅgāt.*

*Na itare itar dharm prasangat.*

\*

**Profile and boundary of understanding**

**IIIA-49.** Understanding is like the profile seen as a reflection in water.

**आदर्शोदकयोः प्रसादस्वाभाव्याद्रूपोपलब्धिबन्तदुपलब्धिः ॥ ४९ ॥**

iii. 1.50. *ādarśa-udakayoḥ prasāda-svābhāvyaḍ rūpa-upalabdhiḥ*

*tadupalabdhiḥ.*

*A-darsh udakayoh prasad sv-bhavyat rup uplabdhivat tat uplabdhih.*

**GIIA-50.** Such profile is to be validated by systematic evidence based refutation of possible alternatives.

**द्रष्टानुमितानां नियोगप्रतिषेधानुपपत्तिः ॥ ५० ॥**

iii. 1.51. *dr̥ṣṭānumitānām hi niyoga-pratiṣedhānupapattih*.<sup>20</sup>

20. NM adds, in the end, the expression *pramāṇasya tattva-viśayatvāt* which occurs in Nbh and NV.

*Drasht anumitanam hi niyog pratishedh anuppattih (pramansya tattv vishayatvat).*

**GIIA-51.** Uncertainty arises if the subject appears scattered.

**स्थानान्यत्वे नानात्वादवयविनानास्थानत्वाच्च संशयः ॥ ५१ ॥**

iii. 1.52. *sthānānyatve sati nānātvād<sup>21</sup> avayavi-nānāsthānatvāc ca*

*samśayah.*

21. V, Bibl. Ind. and VSS add *avayavi-nānātvād*.

*Sthan annyatve sati nanatvat avyavi nana sthanatvat ch sanshyah.*

**GIIA-52a-d.** Its understanding emerges if its parts are bound by a wrap.

It is not that meaning is not communicated by individual part or events.

Inference of fire from the sight of smoke is based on such a wrap of underlying relations (*concomitant invariance*).

Insight and understanding are irrelevant if such key considerations are left out.

## त्वगव्यतिरेकात् ॥ ५२ ॥

iii. 1.53. *tvag avyatirekāt.*

Note. In Bibl. Ind. and V, the following three expressions (which occur in Nbh) are read as *sūtra*-s after the present one— (i) *na, indriyāntara-ārtha-anupalabdheḥ*. (ii) *tvag-avyava-viśeṣeṇa dhūma-upalabdhivat tad upalabdhīḥ*; (iii) *vyāhatatvād ahetuḥ*.

*Tvag a-vyatirekat.*

*Na indriyantār arth anupalabdheḥ.*

*Tvag avyav viśeṣeṇa dhūma uplabdhivat tat uplabdhīḥ.*

*Vyāhatvat a-hetuḥ.*

GIIIA-53. This is not because meaning is not coincident with input of information.

## न युगपदर्थानुपलब्धेः ॥ ५३ ॥

iii. 1.54. *na, yugapad<sup>22</sup> artha-anupalabdheḥ.*

22. VSS : *ayugapad.*

*Na yugpad arth anupalabdheḥ.*

GIIIA-54. Information and its meaning are not wrapped together for refutation.

## विप्रतिषेधाच्च न त्वगेका ॥ ५४ ॥

iii. 1.55. *viṣṭiṣedhāc ca na tvag ekā.*

*Vi-pratiṣedhah na tvag eka.*

GIIIA-55. (For example) Sense-organs provide five kinds of information (*about the same entity or event*).

## इन्द्रियार्थपञ्चत्वात् ॥ ५५ ॥

iii. 1.56. *indriya-ārtha-pañcatvāt.*

*Indriy arth pañchatvat.*

GIIIA-56. It is not that they communicate different meanings.

## न तदर्थबहुत्वात् ॥ ५६ ॥

iii. 1.57. *na, tad-ārtha-bahutvāt.*

*Na tat arth bahutvat.*

GIIIA-57. Yet smell of an object is not refuted if its odor is not sensed.

## गन्धत्वाद्यव्यतिरेकाद्गन्धादीनामप्रतिषेधः ॥ ५७ ॥

iii. 1.58. *gandhatvādi-avyatirekāḍ gandhādinām apratiṣedhah.*

*Gandhatv-adi a-vyatirekat gandh-adinam a-pratishedhah.*

**GIHA-58.** Understanding of a subject seeks unity of parts.

**विषयत्वाव्यतिरेकादेकत्वम् ॥ ५८ ॥**

iii. 1.59. *viṣayatva-avyatirekāḍ ekatvam.*

*Vishayatv a-vyatirekat ekatvam.*

**GIHA-59.** This is not because understanding is a defined construct of characteristics, position (in space or hierarchy), category, form, and class.

**न बुद्धिलक्षणाधिष्ठानगत्याकृतिजातिपञ्चत्वैभ्यः ॥ ५९ ॥**

iii. 1.60. *na, buddhilakṣaṇa-adhiṣṭhāna-gati-ākṛti-jāti-pañcatvebhyaḥ.*

*Na buddhi lakchan adhishtan gati akrati jati panchatve-bhyah.*

\*

*Understanding as the unity of parts*

**GIHA-60.** Particular combinations of elements and qualities determine individual identities.

**भूतगुणविशेषोपलब्धेस्तादात्म्यम् ॥ ६० ॥**

iii. 1.61. *bhūta-guṇaviśeṣa-upalabdhes tādātmyam.*

*Bhut gun-visheshah uplabdheh tad-atmyam.*

**GIHA-61.** (For example) The earth element relates to odor, taste, form, and touch (*but not the sound*).

**गन्धरसरूपस्पर्शशब्दानां स्पर्शपर्यन्ताः पृथिव्याः ॥ ६१ ॥**

iii. 1.62. *gandha-rasa-rūpa-sparśa-śabdānāṃ sparśa-paryantāḥ*

*prthivyāḥ.*

*Gandh ras rup sparsh shabdanam sparsh paryantah prathivyah.*

**GIHA-62.** Water relates to taste, form, touch; fire to form and touch; and air to touch.

**अग्नेजोवायूनां पूर्वं पूर्वमपोऽकाशस्योत्तरः ॥ ६२ ॥**

iii. 1.63. *ap-tejo-vāyūnāṃ pūrvam pūrvam apohya ākāśasya uttarah.*

*Ap tejah vayunam purvam purvam apohya akashasya uttarah.*

**GIHA-63.** It is not that all qualities depend directly on the four elements.

**न सर्वगुणानुपलब्धेः ॥ ६३ ॥**

iii. 1.64. *na, sarvaguna-anupalabdheh.*

*Na sarv gun anuplabdheh.*

**GIHA-64.** A unified whole emerges as consistency of parts is established in stages.

**एकैकशयेनोत्तरोत्तरगुणसद्भावादुत्तराणां तदुपलब्धिः॥६४॥**

iii. 1.65. *ekaikaśyena<sup>23</sup> uttara-uttara-guṇa-sadbhāvād uttara-uttarāṇām tadanupalabdhiḥ.<sup>24</sup>*

23. ASS, Bibl. Ind., R, B, nvr and V : *ekaikasya eva.* The present reading agrees with NV and NSN.

24. ASS and R : *upalabdhiḥ.*

*Ek ek shyen uttar-uttar gun sadbhavat uttaranam tat uplabdhih.*

**GIHA-65, 66.** Certain qualities emerge from combinations where each of the components loses its identity.

**संसर्गाच्चानेकगुणग्रहणम् ॥ ६५ ॥**

*sansargat ch anek gun grahnam.*

**विष्टं ह्यपरं परेण ॥ ६६ ॥**

iii. 1.66. *viṣṭam hi aparam pareṇa.*

Note. According to some, the present *sūtra* is preceded by the *sūtra* : *saṃsargācca aneka-guṇa-grahaṇam.* *Phaṇibhūṣaṇa*, following NSN, does not read it as a *sūtra* (and includes it in the *bhāṣya* on iii. 1.65). He, however, comments that it seems to be a separate *sūtra* from the remarks of Vātsyāyana.

*Vishtam hi a-param paren.*

**GIHA-67.** Such emergence of qualities is not because earth and water (elements) are evident to senses.

**न पार्थिवाप्ययोः प्रत्यक्षत्वात् ॥ ६७ ॥**

iii. 1.67. *na, pāṛthiva-āpyayoh pratyakṣatvāt.*

*Na parthiv apy-yoh pratyakchatvat.*

**GIHA-68.** Underlying quality may be determined by the main element.

**पूर्वपूर्वगुणोत्कर्षात्तत्प्रधानम् ॥ ६८ ॥**

iii. 1.68. *pūrvam pūrvam guṇa-utkarṣāt tat-tat-pradhānam.*

*Purv purv gun utkarshat tat tat pradhanam.*

**GIHA-69.** Yet qualities also depend on the complex organization of elements and the order in which they are combined.

**तद्व्यवस्थानं तु भूयस्त्वात् ॥ ६९ ॥**

iii. 1.69. *tad-vyavasthānam tu bhūyastvāt.*

*Tat vyavasthanam tu bhuyastvat.*

**GIHA-70, 71.** Senses respond to such complex qualities, and they are accepted as sense inputs.

**सगुणानामिन्द्रियभावात् ॥ ७० ॥**

iii. 1.70. *saguṇānām indriya-bhāvāt.*

*Sa-gunanam indriy bhavat.*

**तेनैव तस्याग्रहणाच्च ॥ ७१ ॥**

iii. 1.71. *tena eva tasya agrahaṇāc ca.*

*Ten ev tasya aa-grahanat ch.*

**GIHA-72.** This not because quality of word is complex.

**न शब्दगुणोपलब्धेः ॥ ७२ ॥**

iii. 1.72. *na, śabdaguṇa-upalabdheḥ.*

*Na shabd gun uplabdheh.*

**GIHA-73.** However communicated words assume qualities of the contexts.

**तदुपलब्धिरितरेतरद्रव्यगुणवैधर्म्यात् ॥ ७३ ॥**

iii. 1.73. *tad-upalabdhir itaretara-dravya-guṇa-vaidharmyāt.*

*Tat uplabdhih itar-itar dravya gun vaidharmyat.*

\*\*\*\*\*